



City of Camarillo

Planning Commission AGENDA REPORT COVER

DATE: December 5, 2023

TO: Planning Commission

FROM: David C. Moe II, Interim Community Development Director

SUBMITTED BY: Jaclyn Lee, Planning Manager

SUBJECT: Second Subsequent MND 2023-4, CPD-226M(5), and CUP-422, Costco Wholesale

PROJECT INFORMATION SUMMARY

Request: The applicant requests approval of a modification to Commercial Planned Development permit (CPD-226) for the development of approximately 20 acres into a 163,397-square-foot retail warehouse and the construction of a free-standing fuel facility. The applicant also submitted a request for Conditional Use Permit (CUP-422) for the off-sales of alcoholic beverages.

Applicant: MG2 (Architects), 3333 Michelson Drive, Suite 100, Irvine, CA 92612

Property Owner: Springville Camarillo Owner, LLC, 9950 Jefferson Boulevard Building 2, Culver City, CA 90232

Project Site Size, Location, and Parcel Number: The project area is approximately 20 acres located south of U.S. 101, north of West Ventura Boulevard, approximately 980 feet east of Springville Drive, and west of Home Depot in the Commercial Planned Development (CPD) Zone within the Airport North Specific Plan. The Tax Assessor's parcel number for the parcel that constitutes the project site is 230-0-020-250.

Location Map



Decision-Making Authority: Pursuant to Camarillo Municipal Code (CMC) Section 19.68.020.C 19.26.030, and 19.26.040, the Planning Commission is the decision-maker for the requested major modification to the Commercial Planned Development Permit (CPD) and the Conditional Use Permit (CUP).

General Plan Land Use Designation: Commercial

Airport North Specific Plan Land Use Plan Designation: Commercial

Zoning Designation: Commercial Planned Development (CPD)

PUBLIC NOTICE

A Notice of Public Hearing has been advertised for the Planning Commission meeting of December 5, 2023, with notices mailed to all property owners and residential occupants within a 600-foot radius of the subject site, posted at Camarillo City Hall, as well as on the City's website (www.cityofcamarillo.org), and published in a newspaper of general circulation within the area (Ventura County Star). Additionally, an on-site sign advertising the meeting has been placed on the project site.

DISCUSSION

Parcel and Area Characteristics

The 20-acre project site is located south of U.S. 101, north of West Ventura Boulevard and the Camarillo Airport, and approximately 980 feet east of Springville Drive. The site is immediately west of Home Depot. The site is relatively flat with a gentle southerly slope. The site is currently vacant.

Project Site & Surrounding Uses

	GENERAL PLAN LAND USE DESIGNATION	ZONING DESIGNATION	CURRENT LAND USE
PROJECT SITE	Commercial	CPD	Vacant
NORTH	Linkage	n/a	U.S. 101
SOUTH	Research & Development	Limited Manufacturing (LM)	Vacant
EAST	Commercial	CPD	Commercial uses, Home Depot
WEST	Commercial	CPD	Vacant

Entitlement History

On September 12, 2007, the City Council approved CPD-226 and CUP-294, to permit the construction of up to a 499,000-square-foot commercial center, previously referred to as the Paseo Camino Real shopping center. CUP-294 was approved to allow the building height to exceed 35 feet. Accompanying the original application were four companion applications that included a General Plan Amendment (GPA 2006-2) from Office to General Commercial, including a corresponding amendment to the Airport North Specific Plan, and two requests for Changes of Zone (CZ-297 and CZ-298) from LM and Professional Office (PO) to CPD.

On February 15, 2011, the Planning Commission approved a modification to the Commercial Planned Development permit [CPD-226M(1)], reconfiguring the site plan to accommodate a 155,628-square-foot home improvement store (Lowes). Although the site plan showed a total building area of 454,628 square feet, the project was approved to allow for an overall square footage not to exceed 499,000 square feet. A subsequent modification application [CPD-226M(2)] was filed in 2012; however, it was later withdrawn.

On April 19, 2016, the Planning Commission approved another modification to the Commercial Planned Development permit [CPD-226M(3)], reconfiguring the site plan and modifying the building architecture. The shopping center development anticipated a variety of commercial uses, such as restaurants, a health club, and a 157,801-square-foot anchor commercial tenant. CPD-226M(3) has had several time extensions granted and is set to expire on April 19, 2024, unless another time extension is granted.

Environmental Review

In 2007, the City Council adopted Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 2006-17 for the Paseo Camino Real commercial center project (CPD-226) on a 44.84-acre site, which includes the 20-acre Costco project area, and evaluated the development of up to 499,000 square feet of building coverage with an assumed mix of 429,469 square feet of retail space, 29,531 square feet of restaurant space, and 40,000 square feet of office space.

In 2011, the Planning Commission adopted an Addendum to MND 2006-7 for a Major Modification [CPD-226M(1)]. The modification included changes to the site layout but the overall type and amount of development at the site continued to be less than 499,000 square feet of commercial center building space and the site access points remained unchanged.

In 2016, the Planning Commission adopted Subsequent MND 2016-1 for the Amara Shopping Center project [CPD-226M(3)] for changes to the site plan and building elevations. The Subsequent MND evaluated the development of up to 499,000 square feet in order to provide flexibility in the subsequent site plan development for the project.

A Second Subsequent MND 2023-4 was prepared for the proposed Costco Wholesale and fuel station on 20 acres of the 44.84-acre overall site. The analysis of impacts in Second Subsequent MND 2023-4 tiers off of the analysis presented in the adopted Subsequent MND 2016-1. For purposes of analyzing the remaining 24.84 acres under CEQA, the Second Subsequent MND analyzed up to 335,823 square feet of future commercial building area.

Section 15162 of the Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (State CEQA Guidelines) addresses the situation of when an MND has previously been adopted for a project and the issue of whether a subsequent environmental document needs to be prepared. A subsequent EIR is required: when substantial changes are being proposed for a project which requires major revisions to the previously adopted MND due to new potentially significant environmental effects or a substantial increase in the severity of previously identified potentially significant effects; when substantial changes occur with respect to the circumstances under which the project will be undertaken which will require major revisions to the previous MND due to new potentially significant environmental effects or a substantial increase in the severity of previously identified potentially significant effects; or when there is new information of substantial importance not known at the time of the previous MND's approval. None of these criteria for a subsequent EIR have been met, therefore, a Second Subsequent MND has been prepared.

A Human Health Risk Assessment (HRA) is attached to the Second Subsequent MND 2023-4 as Appendix D, which evaluates the potential Toxic Air Contaminants impacts associated with the fuel station, diesel particulate matter from Costco delivery trucks and transport refrigeration units, and the emergency back-up generator. The Ventura County Air Pollution Control District (VCAPCD) significance thresholds are met if the project generates an increase in toxic air contaminants that does not cause a lifetime probability of contracting cancer of more than 10 in one million or does not result in a

Hazard Index of greater than 1. The HRA demonstrates that the project will have a maximum estimated cancer risk of 5.8 in one million for residential receptors, which is below the threshold of 10 in one million. The study also indicates the project will have a maximum estimated chronic hazard index and maximum estimated acute hazard index of less than 1, below VCAPCD significance thresholds.

Senate Bill (SB) 743, became effective on July 1, 2020 and changed the method of traffic analysis required under CEQA. The previous practice of evaluating traffic transportation impacts used road congestion and delay or level of service (LOS). SB 743 requires the amount of driving and length of trips – as measured by "vehicle miles traveled" or VMT be used to assess transportation impacts on the environment for CEQA review. LOS or road congestion can no longer be used to evaluate transportation impacts under CEQA.

A Daily Trip Generation and VMT study is attached to the Second Subsequent MND 2023-4 as Appendix G. The study compares the proposed Costco project and remaining shopping center daily VMT to that of the previously approved Amara Shopping Center. The study concludes that the proposed project and remaining shopping center will result in 4,591 fewer daily vehicle miles traveled than the previously approved Amara Shopping Center. A reason for this is shifting trips in that a portion of trips to three existing Costcos (Oxnard, Simi Valley and Westlake Village) outside the city will now make a trip to the proposed Costco instead because it is closer or more convenient.

Second Subsequent MND 2023-4 concludes that the approval and implementation of the proposed project will not change the location, type, or maximum amount of development evaluated in previously Subsequent MND 2016-1. The mitigation measures identified in Second Subsequent MND 2023-4 will reduce potential impacts of the proposed project to less than significant levels. As such, no new significant impacts will occur with the proposed project beyond those that were evaluated in Final MND 2006-17 and Subsequent MND 2016-1.

A Notice of Availability and Intent to Adopt a Second Subsequent MND was combined with the Notice of Public Hearing and mailed to all property owners and residential occupants within a 600-foot radius of the subject site, posted at Camarillo City Hall, on the City's website, published in the Ventura County Star and posted on-site. The public comment period to provide written comments on the Second Subsequent MND was from November 9, 2023 through November 28, 2023. A total of 12 comments on the Second Subsequent MND were received during the 20-day public comment period. Although not a requirement under CEQA, responses to comments have been prepared. The comments and responses to comments are included in the Preliminary Final Second Subsequent MND 2023-4 (Attachment 5).

General Plan and Zoning Consistency

The Camarillo General Plan Land Use Map designates the property for commercial uses. The project site is a portion of the 338-acre Airport North Specific Plan approved by the City Council in 1986, and most recently amended by the City Council in September 2007. The Airport North Specific Plan designates the subject property for commercial uses.

The proposed retail wholesale and fuel station are permitted in the CPD Zone, subject to the approval of a Commercial Planned Development permit. The General Plan Circulation Element identifies West Ventura Boulevard as a secondary arterial road with a Class II bike lane.

Proposed Use

The request is to allow the development of a new 163,177-square-foot, one-story Costco Wholesale building and free-standing fuel facility with 16 dispensers (i.e., 32 fueling positions) and a parking lot consisting of approximately 901 stalls on the eastern 20 acres of the project site (proposed project). The applicant is also requesting approval of a CUP for the sale of alcoholic beverages at the Costco warehouse for off-site consumption.

The Costco warehouse building will have one customer entrance to the store located at the building's northwest corner. The building will include a bakery, pharmacy, optical center with optical exams and retail optical sales, hearing aid testing exam and retail hearing aid fitting and sales center, indoor food court, and a photo center along with the sales of over 4,000 products. The building will also include a tire center, which will be approximately 5,318 square feet. The tire center will provide tire sales and tire installation with up to five tire installation bays that face west.

Fuel Station

The fuel station is proposed to be located in the northwestern portion of the Costco development. The gas station includes an 11,000-square-foot canopy and will dispense regular and premium grades of fuel at each fuel pump. There will be four covered fueling bays, each with four gas pumps which fuel two cars each. This results in 16 fueling dispensers that will provide a fueling capacity for 32 cars at a time. A proposed stacking area provides space for an additional 42 cars waiting to get to a fueling position. The gas station is located at the most remote area of the site, which is specifically designed to avoid traffic and queuing conflicts with the warehouse and spillover onto the street. The pumps will be fully automated and self-service for Costco members only, with an attendant present to direct vehicles and oversee operations. There will be no sales of any retail goods other than fuel associated with the fuel station.

Access

Vehicular access to the Costco facility will be provided via two driveways on West Ventura Boulevard and a connection to Overland Road at the northeastern corner of the project site. The westerly driveway on West Ventura Boulevard will be signalized. Truck deliveries will use Overland Road to access the site while truck deliveries to the gas station will access the site from West Ventura Boulevard.

Customer access to the fuel station will be provided from the most westerly drive. Vehicles will turn right at the most northerly drive aisle then right into the queuing area. Vehicles may also enter from the east via Overland Road. An attendant will be present to direct vehicles coming from both directions into the queuing area.

Lighting

Parking and site lighting will incorporate the use of cutoff lenses to keep light from overflowing beyond the project site boundaries. The main parking lot will be illuminated with standard downward pointing lights, each containing LED bulbs affixed to a maximum 35-foot light pole. At the fuel canopy, LED flush lens lights will be recessed into the canopy and provide both lighting during operating hours and a lower level of security lighting after hours.

Operations

Costco is a membership-only retail/wholesale business, selling national brands and private label merchandise for commercial and personal use. The retail warehouse and tire center hours are anticipated to be: Monday through Friday from 10:00 a.m. to 8:30 p.m., Saturday from 9:30 a.m. to 6:00 p.m., and Sunday from 10:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. The gas station hours are anticipated to be daily from 5:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m.

Costco anticipates an average of about ten trucks delivering goods on a typical weekday. The trucks will range in size from 26 feet long for single-axle trailers to 70 feet long for double-axle trailers. Deliveries typically take place in the early morning, with most of the deliveries completed before the 10:00 a.m. opening time. Deliveries to the warehouse are made primarily in Costco trucks from its freight consolidation facility in Mira Loma, California.

The tire center typically will receive shipments of tires one to two times per week in single- or double-trailer trucks of up to 70 feet in length and the same delivery truck will pick up old tires for recycling. Deliveries to and pickups from the tire center will be scheduled for pre-opening hours, typically about 6:00 a.m.

Costco anticipates that the fuel will be delivered to the gasoline facility using three to five trucks per day, as needed. The largest fuel trucks are approximately 70 feet long. While delivering the fuel, the truck will be parked adjacent to the underground tanks on the west side of the gas station and outside of the pump and stacking areas. The truck will not block access to any of the fueling positions.

It is anticipated that Costco Wholesale and the fuel facility will employ approximately 225 to 255 full-time employees.

Alcohol Use

Costco Wholesale proposes to sell a variety of alcoholic beverages and will be required to obtain a Type 21 – Off-Sale General Alcoholic Beverage Control (ABC) license, which authorizes the sale of beer, wine and distilled spirits for consumption off the premises where sold. Minors are allowed on the premises. The proposed floor plan shows liquor sales will utilize 1,980 square feet of interior space and will be located near the back of the warehouse.

The project site is located in Census Tract 56.02 where the recommended guidelines on alcohol license concentration, as determined by the ABC, is five on-sale and three off-sale licenses. There are currently 41 on-sale and 11 off-sale active licenses within the census tract, therefore, the business owner may only receive approval from ABC for a Type 21 license if the City makes a finding of public convenience or necessity (PCN) in

accordance with the provisions of Section 23958.4 of the Business and Professions Code. A PCN determination can be made as Costco Wholesale will create a convenience for the citizens and patrons of the establishment to purchase alcoholic beverages while shopping without the need to travel to other alcoholic beverage establishments. Additionally, the proposed use will provide a use that is currently not available in the city limits.

Airport Compatibility

The project has been reviewed by the Camarillo Airport and has been determined to be compatible with the airport operations, Airport Compatibility Land Use Plan (ACLUP) and under the maximum building coverage of 50 percent prescribed in the ACLUP. Recommended conditions of approval from the airport are included in the conditions, which include the requirement to provide an Avigation Easement to the County of Ventura acknowledging the existence of the airport and that there are restrictions on the height of structures and vegetation, as well as restrictions on lighting or anything that might obscure the visibility of pilots. The easement will state that the store's location near airport may result in noise and other emissions associated with the operation of aircraft.

Off-Street Parking

As indicated in the table below, the proposed Costco project requires a total of 788 parking spaces. The site plan shows that a total of 901 parking spaces will be provided, resulting in a surplus of 113 parking spaces. The project is required to provide a number of these stalls for accessible and electric vehicle charging stalls based on building code requirements that are in effect at the time of plan check.

Parking Summary

Use	Square Footage	Ratio	Parking Required
Costco warehouse	147,879	1:200	740
Tire Center	5,318	1:250 + 3 stalls per bay	37
Hearing and optometrist	2,045	1:200	11
Exterior canopy	7,935	n/a	n/a
TOTAL	163,177		
NUMBER OF STALLS REQUIRED = 788			
NUMBER OF STALLS PROVIDED = 901			

Loading

The truck loading dock is located at the northeastern side of the building. The loading dock area will be depressed four feet below the site grades to accommodate larger delivery trucks and include four individual side-by-side loading bays. The bay doors will be equipped with sealed gaskets to limit unloading noise levels. A smaller on grade door is located on the east side of the building. This door is to receive bread delivery

and FedEx type trucks. A transformer and two fully enclosed trash compactors will also be located along the east side of the building. The transformer and compactors will be enclosed by a 10-foot-high screen wall to block views from West Ventura Boulevard to the south and the loading dock area to the north.

Architecture

The architectural styles permitted in the Airport North Specific Plan echo the design theme of the Heritage Zone requirements of the Camarillo General Plan, with specific references to Mediterranean, Mission, Monterey, and Early California architecture. The proposed development is designed in an Early California style of architecture consistent with the Heritage Zone and Airport North Specific Plan guidelines.

The warehouse building provides arches along an entry colonnade, a sloped roof at the main entry, hipped roof towers, and materials that include clay roof tiles, textured exterior wall panels in an off-white color with dark bronze cornice and limestone and brick veneers. The fuel canopy provides for matching materials to the warehouse, including clay roof tiles and brick veneer.

The warehouse building measures 33'-10" in height to the top of the cornice and provides two decorative tower features up to 38'-6". The fuel canopy provides a height of 22'-4". The proposed building heights were reviewed by the Camarillo Airport and determined to be within the allowable height limits under Federal Aviation Regulations (FAR Part 77) and the Avigation Easement held by the County of Ventura.

STAFF REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION

The project complies with the Municipal Code requirements and is consistent with the Airport North Specific Plan, which envisioned the area to be developed with high-quality development consisting of land uses that are compatible and sensitive to surrounding land uses, including the airport, freeway, and existing industrial developments.

Additionally, the project is consistent with the Economic Development Strategic Plan, which was adopted to foster growth in the Camarillo economy, as it promotes the objective of encouraging optimal land use patterns to ensure the long-term viability of Camarillo's commercial and industrial areas.

The proposed project is consistent with the Camarillo General Plan, including the Heritage Zone design guidelines of the Community Design Element as follows:

Community Design Element Policy CD-1.4.2 a. through h.: *Enhance design for all new development and redevelopment through application of materials and design elements including:*

- a. Richness and authenticity of material surface and texture.*
- b. Muted earth tone colors (such as off-whites, ochres, siennas, umbers, beiges, tans, browns or other similar subdued colors) for primary building surfaces, with more intense colors limited to accents.*
- c. Significant wall articulation (insets, canopies, wing walls, trellis features, arcades, colonnades).*
- d. Full-sloped roofs, multi-planed roofs (combination of pitched and flat roofs).*

- e. *Roof overhangs, articulated eaves, and parapets.*
 - f. *Window configurations compatible with the design of the building.*
 - g. *Articulated building mass and form.*
 - h. *Landscape elements, which include planting and hardscape that complement the style of architecture, enhance building site design and are integrated into the surrounding context.*
- The proposed development is consistent with the Heritage Zone design standards, as the building is proposed to be designed in an Early California style of architecture and provides design features including provides arches along an entry colonnade, a sloped roof at the main entry, hipped roof towers, and materials that include clay roof tiles, textured exterior wall panels in an off-white color with dark bronze cornice.

Community Design Element Goal CA-1: Create and maintain attractive and vibrant commercial developments.

- The project provides a well-designed site layout with adequate parking, and safe and convenient access and circulation. The project provides for an Early California style of architecture, consistent with the Heritage Zone requirements of the General Plan.

General Plan Land Use Element, Commercial Principle: *Provide adequate land and proper location for the various types of commercial activities so that they can provide optimum service to the community and surrounding service area.*

- The proposed retail warehouse use and fuel station will serve the residents of the City and surrounding areas, as there is currently no such use located within city limits and will provide a convenience as currently customers have to travel outside the city to obtain these services.

Findings

Staff has reviewed the proposed project and finds it to be consistent with the applicable goals and policies of the City's General Plan, Airport North Specific Plan and the development standards set forth in the Zoning Ordinance.

Staff therefore recommends approval of CPD-226M(5) and CUP-422, subject to the attached recommended conditions. If the Planning Commission concurs with staff's recommendation to approve CPD-226M(5) and CUP-422, a resolution containing findings for approval of the request is attached to this report.

SUGGESTED ACTION

1. Adopt a resolution approving Subsequent MND 2023-4
2. Adopt a resolution approving CPD-226M(5) and CUP-422, subject to the recommended conditions of approval. The action of the Planning Commission is final, unless an appeal is filed within ten (10) days of the date of their action.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Resolution for Second Subsequent MND 2023-4
2. Resolution for CPD-226M(5) and CUP-422
3. Location Map
4. Public Hearing Notice
5. Preliminary Final Second Subsequent MND 2023-4

REFERENCE MATERIALS – AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT CITY HALL AND ON CITY WEBSITE AT www.cityofcamarillo.org/pendingprojects

1. Draft Second Subsequent MND 2023-4